

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
NORFOLK DIVISION**

DOUGLAS I. HORNSBY, Administrator of)	
The Estate of CYNTHIA GARY,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	Case 2:22-cv-00427
)	
v.)	In Admiralty
)	
THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Defendants.)	
)	

**THE UNITED STATES' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT
OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, TO DISMISS CERTAIN CLAIMS**

The United States moves for summary judgment or dismissal of Plaintiff's claims on the grounds that the United States has breached no legal duty owed to Plaintiff's decedent. The United States' duties as the owner of the McFAUL are set forth by the seminal Supreme Court case *Scindia Steam Navigation Co., Ltd. v. De Los Santos*, 451 U.S. 156 (1981). Because there is no evidence that the United States violated any of the three *Scindia* duties, the Court should grant this motion for summary judgment and dismiss all of Plaintiff's claims against the United States.

Alternatively, if summary judgment is not granted, several of Plaintiff's claims should be dismissed for lack of subject matter jurisdiction, narrowing the issues in the case. Specifically, Plaintiff's claims challenging the Navy's tag out procedures and the design of certain equipment on the McFAUL challenge conduct that is both discretionary and susceptible to policy analysis, therefore the discretionary function exception to the United States' waiver of sovereign immunity applies.

A memorandum in support of this motion, and exhibits thereto, are attached. Exhibits 3, 4, 12, 15, 22, and 23 are covered under the protective order (Dkt. 32) and are filed under seal.

Dated: January 30, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

JESSICA D. ABER
United States Attorney

By: /s/ Garry D. Hartlieb
Garry D. Hartlieb, IL Bar No. 6322571
Assistant U.S. Attorney
Office of the United States Attorney
101 West Main Street, Suite 8000
Norfolk, Virginia 23510-1671
Tel: (757) 441-3173
Fax: (757) 441-6689
E-mail: garry.hartlieb@usdoj.gov

ERIK S. SIEBERT
Acting Assistant Attorney General

By: /s/ Shaun M. Pehl
Malinda R. Lawrence, ME Bar No. 004351
James R. Whitman, DC Bar No. 987694
Shaun M. Pehl, WA Bar No. 45534
Michelle Delemarre,
Trial Attorneys
United States Department of Justice
Civil Division, Torts Branch
Aviation, Space & Admiralty Litigation
175 N Street, NE, 11th Floor
Washington, DC 20002
Tel: (202) 307-0033/(202) 305-8049
Fax: (202) 616-4002
E-mail: Malinda.R.Lawrence@usdoj.gov
E-mail: james.whitman@usdoj.gov
E-mail: shaun.pehl@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for the United States

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 30, 2025, I filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send a notification of electronic filing (NEF) to the following counsel of record:

Robert J. Haddad, Esq.
Andrew M. Hendrick, Esq.
RULOFF, SWAIN, HADDAD,
MORECOCK,
TALBERT & WOODWARD, P.C.
317 30th Street
Virginia Beach, VA 23451
Telephone: (757) 671-6036
Facsimile: (757) 671-6004
Email: rhaddad@srgslaw.com
Email: ahendrick@srgslaw.com
*Counsel for Douglas I. Hornsby,
Administrator of the Estate of Cynthia Gary*

Lynn K. Brugh, IV, Esq.
Jack A. Irvin, Esq.
WILLIAMS MULLEN
200 South 10th Street, Suite 1600
Richmond, VA 23219
Telephone: (804) 420-6461
Facsimile: (804) 420-6507
Email: lbrugh@williamsmullen.com
Email: jirvin@williamsmullen.com
*Attorneys for Defendant Metro Machine
Corp. d/b/a General Dynamics NASSCO-
Norfolk*

Jennifer Eaton, Esq.
Katherine Lennon Ellis, Esq.
WOODS ROGERS VANDEVENTER
BLACK PLC
101 West Main St., Suite 500
Norfolk, Virginia, 23510
Telephone: 757-446-8600
Fax: 757-446-8670
Email: Jennifer.Eaton@wrvblaw.com
Email: Kate.Lennon@wrvblaw.com
*Attorneys for Defendant, Advanced
Integrated Technologies, LLC*

By: /s/ Shaun M. Pehl
Shaun M. Pehl, WA Bar No. 45534
Trial Attorney
United States Department of Justice
Civil Division, Torts Branch
Aviation, Space & Admiralty Litigation
175 N Street, NE, 11th Floor
Washington, DC 20002
Phone: (202) 598-5779
Fax: (202) 616-4002
Email: Malinda.R.Lawrence @usdoj.gov
Counsel for the United States